

ACADEMIC SENATE MINUTES

JUNE 19, 1991

CALL TO ORDER

Vice-Chair Baldino called the meeting to order at 3 p.m.

OUTLINE OF AGENDA FOR MEETING

Dr. Baldino indicated that after a few brief comments including a statement from Chair of the Senate, Dr. Jenkins, Dr. Blue would read the letter to the faculty from the Faculty Interviewing Body (Senate Executive Committee and Graduate Council) and would read a letter sent to the members of the Board of Trustees from the Faculty Interviewing Body. Then Dr. Murphy would offer a motion to show Senate support for actions taken by the Faculty Interviewing Committee. The floor would then be open for discussion on the motion made by Dr. Murphy.

RECOGNITION OF MEDIA CENTER, PRINT SHOP, AND MAIL ROOM PERSONNEL EFFORTS

Dr. Baldino acknowledged the efforts of the Media Center, the Print Shop, and the Mail Room personnel to help make today's meeting possible by reading the following statement.

The Senate wishes to express its heartfelt thanks to the Media Center, the Print Shop and the Mail Room staff for their outstanding cooperation in enabling the secretary to get agendas and information to Senators and other University personnel in a timely manner. Print Shop turnaround time was one-half hour and the Mail Room had labels affixed and items in the next scheduled mailing.

There was a round of applause from the floor to recognize the efforts of these groups.

STATEMENT FROM DR. WILLIAM JENKINS, CHAIR OF SENATE

Although I am out of state vacationing at this time, I have found it necessary, given the recent actions of the Board of Trustees, to call a special session of the Academic Senate. Dr. Peter Baldino, as Vice-Chair, will conduct the meeting in my absence.

It is my belief that the Board's violation of the Sunshine Law and of the disregard for the process it established for the selection of a new president, as well as the fact that Paul Dutton withdrew prior to evaluation, requires the University community to respond to the Board's action.

For Mr. Dutton to accept the presidency under such clouded conditions will undermine his ability to establish a working relationship with the University community.

I am in support of whatever action the Academic Senate decides to take and will carry through such directives upon my return.

STATEMENT FROM DR. BALDINO

I would like to express my deep appreciation to all of you for coming to this very important meeting. I would especially like to apologize to the Media for asking they not pursue me and other faculty involved in the search process regarding our views on this very important matter. Rest assured that it was not because we do not care deeply about what was at issue here; but, rather, because we do feel very deeply about what is at issue here.

I have here a copy of a position announcement which is sent to all men and women wishing to serve at this fine University. On this position announcement there is written these words, "Y.S.U. is an equal opportunity employer." Setting aside for now the question of qualifications, which will be addressed by Dr. Blue in a few minutes, I would ask each and every one who has followed the sad events of this past week to search her/his conscience and ask a very fundamental question, "Has our commitment to the idea of being an equal opportunity employer been honored or violated?" Have the candidates for president of Youngstown State University who came to us from as far away as Texas, Wisconsin, Massachusetts, Maryland, and also Youngstown State University been given equal opportunity?

Many years ago, Matthew Arnold wrote of a man caught between two worlds--one dead, the other too powerless to be born. The rusted steel mills that dot the landscape of Youngstown remind me of the Youngstown that is dead. The sad events of the past week remind me so much of that world too powerless to be born. It need not be that way. And maybe, just maybe, it will not be that way, and we will see the birth of a new Youngstown--a Youngstown that will redeem the faith put in it by those hard-working, fair-minded men and women who settled here. And that by word and deed, together, together, we will do what is right and just for all who walk our campus.

There was extensive applause in response to Dr. Baldino's remarks.

The Vice-Chair thanked everyone and thanked those who are not here who should be here.

FACULTY INTERVIEWING BODY RESPONSE TO BOARD OF TRUSTEE ACTION

Dr. Blue read the report to the Youngstown State University Faculty from the Faculty Interviewing Body and the letter to the members of the Board of Trustees from the Faculty Interviewing Body. Both are attached as Appendix A to the minutes.

There was a round of applause at the conclusion of Dr. Blue's report.

Motion to Adopt and Endorse the Findings of the Faculty Interviewing Body

The Chair recognized Dr. G. Murphy.

I personally applaud the clear, complete, and comprehensive response from the Faculty Interviewing Body and the steps they have taken. It would seem appropriate that the Senate forward to the Board of Trustees a clear message of support for this document.

Dr. G. Murphy moved the following: "I move we adopt and strongly endorse the findings of the Faculty Interviewing Body as stated in their report of 18 June 1991 and their conclusion that the Board of Trustees has failed to follow the procedures the Board set forth in the Presidential Search Mechanism document."

Motion seconded by L. Hugenberg.

The Vice-Chair asked for debate on the question before the body.

B. Fry, Past President of Student Government, was recognized.

At the door, there was a resolution written by Eric Stephens and myself that we planned to offer as a motion at today's meeting. We did not know that the faculty planned to offer a motion. I would like to read that resolution and ask that it be added as an amendment to the motion on the floor.

Understanding that the Board of Trustees of Youngstown State University have chosen a candidate that did not complete the presidential search process and completely disregarded the recommendations of the Student Government Interviewing Committee, and completely disregarded the recommendations of the YSU Foundation Interviewing Committee, and completely disregarded the recommendations of the Administration Interviewing Committee, and completely disregarded the recommendations of the Alumni Association Interviewing Committee; therefore, it is resolved that the Academic Senate reject the Board of Trustees selection and recognize that the search process be repudiated and that a new selection process be instated.

We were not aware that the faculty members had produced a resolution of their own; therefore, I would like to add this, if I may, as an amendment to send along with the faculty motion to the Board of Trustees.

Student Government Statement Accepted As Friendly Amendment

The Vice-Chair announced, in the absence of an objection, that the resolution from the Student Government would be treated as a friendly amendment to the motion on the floor.

B. Fry then asked for permission to read a statement worked out by Eric Stephens, himself, and the current representatives of the Student Government.

About a month and a half ago, an article appeared in the Cleveland Plain Dealer that contained the following quote from Trustee Chair, Dr. John Geletka, in response to Bob Hagan's assertion that the presidential search process was fixed in favor of Attorney Paul Dutton.

Dr. Geletka responded, "I think Mr. Hagan is way out of line. I have spent 40 to 50 hours in meetings on this. If Mr. Dutton is the choice, I guess I've just been wasting my time." (There was much laughter and applause.)

It is now fair to say, Mr. Geletka, that you were wasting your own, the faculty's, the student's and everyone else's time with your so-called presidential search.

I am ashamed that I have to stand here today and speak so strongly against the Board of Trustee Chair, but that is what is called for now. The time has come for the students, faculty, and staff on this campus to unite and overturn a decision made by five men who have put personal interests in front of all our lives and careers. (Applause) I have spoken for some time about back room deals and conflict of interest and now we have seen both to their fullest and most dangerous extent. Despite the fact that Mr. Paul Dutton received no recommendations from any search sub-committee and despite the fact that he was not a candidate at the time of the selection, he was given the appointment. He was approached personally by Dr. Geletka and Mr. Monus and asked to take the job after he claimed to have lost interest in the position.

Why did Mr. Dutton change his mind? He says it is because of all the support he has. (Laughter) I think the events of the last two days show clearly that his supporters are vastly outnumbered by people who are looking for honesty and integrity in the search procedure. (Applause)

If you feel you have been ignored, you are right; but the trustees cannot continue to ignore a campus unified against their unethical actions. Mr. Monus, Mr. Geletka, Mr. O'Connell, Mr. Flask and Mr. Lyden, we are here to send you a message: Stop using the university community as pawns in your game of personal interests and back room deals and start concerning yourselves with the betterment of this university for us and those who follow us. Thank you.

There was a standing ovation for Mr. Fry and his remarks.

E. Stephens, Second Vice President, Ex-Officio Member was recognized.

In addition to Mr. Fry's statement, Student Government has some comments that it wishes to make regarding the selection process.

Student Government has some very important comments that it wishes to make at this time. As you know, Student Government was the first to criticize and bring to light the many problems surrounding the YSU Board of Trustees' presidential search process.

As a result of their decision, the student leaders have experienced many attempts to keep them from expressing their views on the Trustee's decision. These attempts have been numerous and very blunt and subtle and have taken place intermittently over the last few months. The current and past Student Government presidents, the current and former Executive Committees, YSU Student Academic Senators, and other student leaders have been victims. Not only do we fear for ourselves, but also for the members of our families who are employees of Youngstown State University. The people who have been committing the pressure are faculty members and others. These people know who they are and so do we. Even so, we have chosen not to yield to this pressure; and we will not. Instead, we have chosen to apply our energies to the creation of a resolution calling for the rejection of the Trustee's selection

and for the reinstatement of a new process unscathed by the allegations of wrong doing and unmarked by past attempts at intimidation. (Applause)

Further Discussion

The Chair asked if there was further discussion.

Motion for Secret Ballot

B. Fry moved for a secret ballot vote. The motion was seconded. After some discussion, the motion was withdrawn.

Motion for Roll Call Vote

B. Fry moved for a roll call vote. E. Stephens seconded the motion. The Parliamentarian ruled that 20 percent of the Senators would have to vote for the motion. A hand count indicated that there was more than sufficient support for a roll call vote.

The Chair announced that the roll call vote would proceed.

Roll Call Vote

It was requested that the motion be restated. The Secretary reread the motion made by Dr. Murphy and indicated that a "Yes" vote would support Dr. Murphy's motion and the three-page document read by Dr. F. Blue. B. Fry also reread the friendly amendment made by Student Government. A "Yes" vote supports both Dr. Murphy's motion and the Student Government friendly amendment.

The Roll Count Vote resulted in 61 Yes, 5 Abstentions, and 0 No votes. The results of the Roll Call Vote are appended to the Minutes as Appendix B.

ADJOURNMENT

The Chair requested a motion for adjournment. It was moved the meeting be adjourned. The motion received a second. Meeting adjourned at 3:45 p.m.

William Barsch
Shirley Carpenter
David C. Genaway
Sally M. Hordless
Gordon E. Mapley
Charles A. McHenry
Richard A. McEwing
Harold Yarnall

Bernard T. Gillis
Edward Yocwisk
John Yarnall
James Yocwisk
David T. Ruggles
George Saxon
David Swedlund

ENGINEERING

At-Large

Jack Bakos
Duane Rost

Departmental

**Dilip Singh, Chemical Engineering
**Javed Alam, Civil Engineering
*Jalal Jalali, Electrical Engineering
*Hojjat Mehri, Industrial Engineering
*Ganesh Kudav, Mechanical Engineering

DTAM

FINE AND PERFORMING ARTS

At-Large

Joseph Edwards
Darla Funk
Les Hicken
Larry Hugenberg
Ted Perkins
David Robinson
James Umble

[Handwritten]
[Handwritten]
[Handwritten]
[Handwritten]
[Handwritten]

Departmental

*Genevra Kornbluth, Art
*Susan Sexton, Music
**Dan O'Neill, Speech and Theater

[Handwritten]
[Handwritten]

STUDENTS

At-Large

Mac Crum
Michelle Donley
Babur Lateef
Christopher Lim
Karen Melanson
Anthony Pochiro

[Handwritten]

[Handwritten]

School/College

, Education
Erin Fogarty, Performing Arts
, Business
Theresa Leslie, CAST
Najah Hudson, Arts and Sciences
Kelly Senzarin, Engineering

[Handwritten]

Ex-Officio

Brian Fry, Pres., Stu. Gov.
Dan Haude, V. Pres., Stu. Govt.
Eric Stephens, Second V. President

[Handwritten]

[Handwritten]

ADMINISTRATION

Bernard T. Gillis
Bernard Yozwiak
John Yemma
James Cicarelli
David P. Ruggles
George E. Sutton
David Sweetkind

[Handwritten]
[Handwritten]
[Handwritten]
[Handwritten]
[Handwritten]
[Handwritten]
[Handwritten]

William Barsch
Shirley Carpenter
David C. Genaway
Sally M. Hotchkiss
Gordon E. Mapley
Charles A. McBriarty
Richard A. McEwing
Harold Yiannaki

[Handwritten]
[Handwritten]
[Handwritten]
[Handwritten]
[Handwritten]
[Handwritten]
[Handwritten]
[Handwritten]

*First year of two-year term
**Second year of two-year term

ATTENDANCE SHEET

Academic Senate, 1990-1991

DATE: June 19, 1991

APPLIED SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY

At-Large

Robert Campbell
Ralph Crum
Karen Duda
Margaret Horvath
Anthony Messuri

[Handwritten initials]

[Handwritten initials]

[Handwritten initials]

Departmental

*Madeleine Haggerty, A. H.
**Virginia Phillips, B.E.T.
**Joseph Waldron, Crim. Justice
*William Wood, Eng. Technology
*Jim Dishaw, Home Economics
**Sharon Phillips, Nursing

[Handwritten initials]

ARTS AND SCIENCES

At-Large

Samuel Floyd Barger
George Beelen
Paul Dalbec
Larry Esterly
William Jenkins
Gratia Murphy
Lowell Satre
Thomas Shipka
Ronald Tabak
John White

[Handwritten initials]

[Handwritten initials]

[Handwritten initials]

Departmental

*Anthony Sobota, Biology
**Friedrich Koknat, Chemistry
*Teresa Riley, Economics
**Sandra Stephan, English
*John Sarkissian, Foreign Languages
*William Buckler, Geography
**C. Earl Harris, Geology
*John Neville, Health & Physical Educ.
**George Kulchytsky, History
*Richard Goldthwait, Math and Comp. Sci.
**Linda Tessier, Philosophy & Religion
*Edward Mooney, Physics and Astronomy
**George Haushalter, Political Science
*James Morrison, Psychology
**Guido Dobbert, Sociology, Anthropolgy

[Handwritten initials]
[Handwritten initials]
[Handwritten initials]
[Handwritten initials]
[Handwritten initials]
[Handwritten initials]
[Handwritten initials]
[Handwritten initials]
[Handwritten initials]
[Handwritten initials]

BUSINESS ADMINISTRATION

At-Large

James Daly
Inez G. Heal
Donald H. Mathews
Jane S. Reid
Dean Roussos
Eugene A. Sekeres

[Handwritten initials]

[Handwritten initials]

Departmental

*Richard Magner, Accounting
*Donald Hovey, Management
**Homer Warren, Marketing

[Handwritten initials]

EDUCATION

At-Large

Dora Bailey
Peter Baldino
Susan deBlois

[Handwritten initials]

[Handwritten initials]

Departmental

*Phillip Ginnetti, Elementary Education
**James Pusch, Foundations
**Lawrence DiRusso, Guidance & Counseling
**James Douglas, Administration & Sec.
*Len Schaiper, Special Education

[Handwritten initials]

[Handwritten initials]

[Handwritten initials]

+Effective:

September 30, 1990

* First year of two-year term ** Second year



Youngstown State University / Youngstown, Ohio 44555-3415

18 June 1991

To: Youngstown State University Faculty

From: Faculty Interviewing Body (Senate Executive Committee and Graduate Council)

In light of the public controversy surrounding the recent Youngstown State University Board action regarding the Presidential search, we feel that the faculty interviewing body should make a second and longer report of the search process and its results.

At the Academic Senate meeting on May 30, 1990, a motion was proposed by Dr. Peter Baldino that stated "the Senate Executive Committee urges the Board of Trustees to establish a committee to conduct a national search for the next president of Youngstown State University and if/when a vacancy is announced we trust this committee will have representation of staff, faculty, students, administration, and community with the executive committee acting in an advisory capacity." The motion was unanimously carried to recommend the establishment of this university-wide committee.

At its May 29, 1990 meeting the graduate faculty requested that the Board of Trustees establish a search committee to conduct an open national search for a new President and that, in that search, special attention be given to the candidates record in providing creative leadership in facilitating faculty research. In her subsequent memo to the President of the Board, Dr. Hotchkiss renewed the Graduate Council's recommendation that the search committee include representations from the faculty, administration, staff, and community.

On December 5, 1990, the Senate Executive Committee prepared a letter addressed to the Search Committee indicating that the Senate Executive Committee should be actively involved in the Presidential search process, referencing the Academic Senate's May 30 motion as the cornerstone for their involvement in the search process.

On December 11, 1990, the Board communicated a Presidential Search mechanism composed of a Screening Committee and 5 interviewing bodies (see Presidential Search Mechanism Directive dated Dec. 11, 1990); the faculty interviewing body was composed of the members of the Senate Executive Committee and Graduate Council. The committee interviewed all 6 of the candidates selected by the screening committee. The questions asked of every candidate are appended. The committee discussed each candidate soon after each interview and had a final recommending session on May 22, 1991.

The Faculty Interviewing Committee recommended to the screening committee the names of Dr. William W. Chmurny, Dr. Bill Franklin, and Dr. Paul F. Weller. Subsequently, the screening committee requested the faculty interviewing body to rank their candidate choices. The Screening Committee forwarded to the Board of Trustees a list of three names, emerging from the campus-wide interview process: Drs. William Chmurny, Bill Franklin, and Bernard Gillis.

The Senate Executive Committee and the Graduate Council jointly agreed that all candidates should be judged on the basis of:

1. the candidate's vision for and knowledge of the distinctive role of metropolitan state universities and the implications of that role for the teaching, research, and service of the faculty;
2. the candidate's knowledge of the present opportunities and problems for institutions of higher education;
3. the candidate's knowledge of and experience with the internal management of a university, including academic programs, budgeting, governance and administration; the candidate's ability to lead such an academic institution; and the candidate's record of achievement in doing so;
4. the candidate's demonstrated abilities to work with the different constituencies of this university--students, the legislature, the community, business and industry--including articulating Youngstown State University's mission and raising the monies to support that mission.

On the basis of the six candidates' responses to our questions, their vitas, their letters of recommendation, we judged whether or not a candidate met our criteria. Discussions followed the meetings with each of the candidates, and on May 22 we met to make our recommendation to the Screening Committee. We agreed that Dr. William W. Chmurny, Dr. Bill Franklin, Dr. Paul F. Weller were eminently qualified for the position, that Dr. Edgar B. Schick was unacceptable though technically qualified, and that Attorney Paul M. Dutton did not meet the criteria we had established. Each of the candidates we recommended has a record of achievement in university settings and each communicated a positive vision for Youngstown State University. The committee does not recommend Attorney Paul M. Dutton as a candidate for the Presidency of Youngstown State University.



Youngstown State University / Youngstown, Ohio 44555-3415

18 June 1991

To: Members of the Board of Trustees of Youngstown State University

From: Faculty Interviewing Committee (Senate Executive Committee and Graduate Council)

Dear Members of the Board:

The Faculty Interviewing Committee objects to the failure of the Board of Trustees to follow procedures stipulated as part of the search mechanism for the new President of Youngstown State University. The Board's failure to interview the final three candidates emerging from the search mechanism communicates utter disregard for the judgments of the university committees involved in the search process. That action, taken together with the apparent informal interactions between Attorney Dutton and some Board members, gives the appearance of a "shadow process" inconsistent with the collegial spirit of a fair and open search process. The Board's failure to treat as the primary candidates those individuals who emerged from the campus-wide collegial process is an affront to all communities who share in the future of Youngstown State University.

SENATE ROLL CALL

YES = 61 ABSTAIN = 5 NO = 0

APPENDIX B

____ June 19, 1991 ____
(DATE)

Alam, Javed	_Y_	Leslie, Theresa	_____
Bailey, Dora	_Y_	Lim, Christopher	_____
Bakos, Jack	_Y_	Magner, Richard	_____
Baldino, Peter	_Y_	Mapley, Gordon	_Y_
Barger, Samuel Floyd	_Y_	Mathews, Donald	_Y_
Barsch, William	_Y_	McBriarty, Charles	_Y_
Beelen, George	_A_	McEwing, Richard A.	_Y_
Buckler, William	_Y_	Mehri, Hojjat	_Y_
Campbell, Robert	_____	Melanson, Karen	_____
Carpenter, Shirley	_A_	Messuri, Anthony	_Y_
Cicarelli, James	_Y_	Mooney, Edward	_Y_
Crum, Ralph	_Y_	Morrison, James	_Y_
Crum, Mac	_Y_	Murphy, Gratia	_Y_
Dalbec, Paul	_Y_	Neville, John	_Y_
Daly, James	_Y_	O'Neill, Dan	_Y_
deBlois, Susan	_Y_	Perkins, Tedrow	_Y_
DiRusso, Lawrence	_____	Philips, Sharon	_____
Dishaw, Jim	_____	Phillips, Virginia	_Y_
Dobbert, Guido	_Y_	Pochiro, Anthony	_Y_
Donley, Michele	_Y_	Pusch, James	_Y_
Douglas, James	_____	Reid, Jane S.	_Y_
Duda, Karen	_Y_	Yemma, John	_Y_
Edwards, Joseph	_____	Riley, Teresa	_Y_
Esterly, Larry	_____	Robinson, David	_Y_
Fogarty, Erin	_Y_	Rost, Duane	_____
Fry, Brian	_Y_	Roussos, Dean	_____
Funk, Darla	_Y_	Ruggles, David P.	_Y_
Genaway, David C.	_A_	Sarkissian, John	_Y_
Gillis, Bernard T.	_____	Satre, Lowell	_____
Ginnetti, Phillip	_Y_	Schaiper, Len	_Y_
Goldthwait, Richard	_Y_	Sekeres, Eugene A.	_Y_
Haggerty, Madeleine	_____	Senzarin, Kelly	_____
Harris, C. Earl	_Y_	Sexton, Susan	_____
Haude, Dan	_____	Shipka, Thomas	_A_
Haushalter, George	_Y_	Singh, Dilip	_____
Heal, Inez G.	_Y_	Sobota, Anthony	_____
Hicken, Les	_____	Stephan, Sandra	_Y_
Horvath, Margaret	_____	Stephens, Eric	_Y_
Hotchkiss, Sally M.	_Y_	Sutton, George E.	_Y_
Hovey, Donald	_____	Sweetkind, David	_Y_
Hudson, Najah	_____	Tabak, Ronald	_Y_
Hugenberg, Lawrence	_Y_	Tessier, Linda	_Y_
Jalali, Jalal	_Y_	Umble, James	_Y_
Jenkins, William	_____	Waldron, Joseph	_Y_
Koknat, Friedrich	_____	Warren, Homer	_Y_
Kornbluth, Genevra	_Y_	White, John	_____
Kudav, Ganesh	_____	Wood, William	_____
Kulchytsky, George	_____	Yiannaki, Harold	_A_
Lateef, Babur	_____	Yozwiak, Bernard	_Y_